1 Endogenous CO₂ ice mixture on the surface of Europa and no detection of plume activity

2 G. L. Villanueva^{1,*}, H. B. Hammel², S. N. Milam¹, S. Faggi^{1,3}, V. Kofman^{1,3}, L. Roth⁴, K. P.

- 3 Hand⁵, L. Paganini⁶, J. Stansberry⁷, J. Spencer⁸, S. Protopapa⁸, G. Strazzulla⁹, G. Cruz-Mermy¹⁰,
- 4 C. R. Glein¹¹, R. Cartwright¹², G. Liuzzi¹³
- 5
- 6 ¹ NASA Goddard Space Flight Center, Greenbelt MD 20771, USA
- 7 * Corresponding author: geronimo.villanueva@nasa.gov
- 8 ² Association of Universities for Research in Astronomy, Washington DC 20004, USA
- 9 ³ American University, Washington, DC 20016, USA
- 10 ⁴ Royal Institute of Technology, Stockholm 104 50, Sweden
- ⁵ Jet Propulsion Laboratory, Pasadena CA 91109, USA
- 12⁶ NASA Headquarters, Washington DC 20546, USA
- ⁷ Space Telescope Science Institute, Baltimore MD 21218, USA
- 14 ⁸ Southwest Research Institute, Boulder CO 80302, USA
- ⁹ Osservatorio Astrofisico di Catania, Istituto Nazionale di Astrofisica, 95123 Catania, Italy
- 16 ¹⁰ Universite Paris-Sarclay, 91190 Gif-sur-Yvette, France
- 17 ¹¹ Southwest Research Institute, San Antonio TX 78238, USA
- ¹² Carl Sagan Center for Research, Search for Extraterrestrial Intelligence Institute, Mountain
 View CA 94043, USA
- 20 ¹³ Università degli Studi della Basilicata, 85100 Potenza, Italy
- 21
- 22 Published in Science on September 21st 2023
- 23 <u>https://www.science.org/journal/science</u>
- 24
- 25

26 Jupiter's moon Europa has a sub-surface ocean beneath an icy crust. Conditions within the 27 ocean are unknown, and it is unclear whether it is connected to the surface. We observed 28 Europa with the James Webb Space Telescope (JWST) to search for active release of 29 material by probing its surface and atmosphere. A search for plumes yielded no detection 30 of water, carbon monoxide, methanol, ethane, nor methane fluorescence emissions. Four 31 spectral features of CO_2 ice were detected; their spectral shapes and distribution across 32 Europa's surface indicate the CO₂ is mixed with other compounds and concentrated in 33 Tara Regio. The ¹³CO₂ absorption is consistent with an isotopic ratio of ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C = 83 \pm 19$. 34 We interpret these observations as indicating that carbon is sourced from within Europa. 35

36 Jupiter's moon Europa is thought to host a subsurface ocean beneath a surface icy crust, which 37 has a thickness estimated to be between 23 and 47 km (1). Spacecraft measurements have shown 38 Europa has an induced magnetic field, which has been interpreted as due to a deep salty ocean 39 (2, 3). Smaller liquid water bodies might also be present within the ice shell (4). Europa's surface 40 is one of the youngest in the Solar System, with the near absence of impact craters indicating an 41 age in the range of 40 to 90 million years old (5). The extensive resurfacing is probably due to 42 tidal heating sustained by orbital resonance, which could power cryovolcanism (6) where water 43 and volatiles are erupted through the ice crust at freezing temperatures, and the upwelling of 44 material forming ice domes (7). These processes would provide pathways for subsurface 45 materials to reach the surface, where they could be observed.

46

47 Surface materials could be either endogenous (from within Europa) or exogenous (delivered by
48 impacts or from Jupiter's magnetosphere); distinguishing between these possibilities is required

to infer properties of the subsurface ocean (8). Europa's surface composition is dominated by
water ice (9), with a complex mixture of other compounds, including salts (e.g., NaCl, hydrated
sulfates) (10, 11), and carbon- and sulfur-bearing molecular species (12–14). The diversity of
observed species leads to uncertainty about the endogenous or exogenous nature of material on
Europa's surface.

54 Searches for plume activity

55 A possible indication of endogenic material on Europa would be plumes, ejections of large 56 amounts of material through cracks in the ice opened by the strong tidal forces. Evidence for 57 plumes has been reported using ultraviolet observations of auroral emission lines of hydrogen 58 and oxygen in the southern hemisphere, which were interpreted as due to localized plumes 59 containing up to 1×10^{32} molecules of H₂O (15). This plume activity has not been confirmed by 60 subsequent observations despite several attempts. Magnetic field and plasma wave observations 61 from a close spacecraft flyby of Europa were interpreted as due to a plume (16). Transit 62 observations of the Europa limb have been also interpreted as localized excess emission (17), or 63 alternatively as statistical noise, not plume activity (18). Another study identified one tentative 64 detection (at the 3-sigma level) of water vapor plume activity, within an otherwise quiescent 65 period (19).

To search for active sources on Europa, we probed its atmosphere and surface using JWST (20),
performing imaging with NIRCam (Near Infrared Camera) and spectroscopy in the 2.4–5.2 μm
spectral range (Fig. 1) with NIRSpec (Near Infrared Spectrograph) at a resolving power of
~2700. The observations took place on 2022 November 23 and sample Europa's leading
hemisphere (21). Searching for plume activity was done by probing the narrow molecular

71	infrared features fluorescing in sunlight. We targeted the strong fundamentals bands of H ₂ O at
72	2.7 μ m; CH ₄ , C ₂ H ₆ and CH ₃ OH in the C-H stretch region (near 3.3 μ m); and CO at 4.7 μ m. We
73	extracted an integrated spectrum across a 1.3" diameter region centered on Europa (500 km
74	beyond its radius), sampling the extended region beyond the 1" moon's diameter. We then
75	removed solar and ice absorption features and compared the resulting residual spectra (Fig. S1)
76	to line-by-line fluorescence models by performing retrievals (21). We assumed an excitation
77	rotational temperature of 25 K in the models, similar to the value measured in the plume of
78	Enceladus (22). None of the targeted molecules were detected in the Europa spectrum, and the
79	resulting 3σ upper limits, in units of 10^{30} molecules, are <35 for H ₂ O, <18 for CH ₄ , <18 for
80	C_2H_6 , <93 for CH ₃ OH, and <14 for CO. Assuming an outgassing velocity of 583 m s ⁻¹ (19) and
81	isotropic outflow, the upper-limit of water ($<35 \times 10^{30}$ H ₂ O molecules) corresponds to a water
82	vapor plume activity lower than 1×10^{28} molecule s ⁻¹ (<300 kg s ⁻¹). This upper-limit for water is a
83	factor of two times lower than the previous tentative detection in the leading hemisphere
84	[(70±22)×10 ³⁰ H ₂ O molecules (19)]; a factor of four times lower than inferred from auroral
85	ultraviolet emission lines on the anti-Jovian hemisphere [$(130\pm30)\times10^{30}$ H ₂ O molecules (15)];
86	and five times lower than the median value [180×10^{30} H ₂ O molecules] reported for plumes at the
87	trailing hemisphere (17) . The JWST observations of the leading hemisphere set a limit on
88	sustained water plume activity on Europa; if any plume activity exists on Europa today, it must
89	be localized and weak (16), infrequent and not active during our observations, or devoid of the
90	volatile gases that we searched for.

93 CO₂ detection and isotope ratio

94 An alternative way to probe for endogenic sources on Europa is to search for recently deposited 95 material on its surface. The NIRCam images (Fig. 2A), obtained by combining the observations 96 with filters F140M [1.331 to 1.479 μ m] and F212N [2.109 to 2.134 μ m], show enhanced 97 brightness in Tara Regio (10°S, 75°W), an area of chaos terrain; and on the anti-Jovian side of 98 Europa (180°W). The chaos terrain is an area of irregular groups of large blocks, which are 99 thought to be related to an active geological process. Using the contemporaneously collected 100 NIRSpec spectra of the leading hemisphere, we searched for evidence of CO, CH₄ or CH₃OH 101 ices, but did not detect them. It has been suggested that CO₂ ice on Europa is concentrated on the 102 anti-Jovian and trailing sides of its surface (12), however the absorption bands were only 103 marginally resolved in earlier data (23). Many non-water ice bands have previously been mapped 104 at hemisphere scales, including H₂O₂ at 3.5 μ m (24), CO₂ at 4.3 μ m (12) and SO₂ at 4.0 μ m (12, 105 25). If CO_2 is associated with endogenic landforms, then it would provide information on 106 Europa's interior, such as the carbon content of the ocean. Theoretical models have predicted 107 that the ocean contains dissolved CO_2 and other carbonate species (26), yet observations in the 108 near infrared $(1-2.5 \,\mu\text{m})$ did not detect CO₂ (27) on Europa, so its presence and distribution 109 remain unclear.

In the JWST data, we detect multiple features due to CO₂ ice on Europa: a narrow absorption band at 2.7 μ m (Fig. 1B), a double-peaked absorption band at 4.25 and 4.27 μ m (Fig. 1C), and an absorption due to the isotopologue ¹³CO₂ at 4.38 μ m (Fig. S2C). ¹³CO₂ has previously been observed on two of Saturn's moons, Phoebe and Iapetus (*28*), but not on Europa. From the ratio of the ¹²CO₂ and ¹³CO₂ features, we estimate the carbon isotopic ratio ¹²C/¹³C = 83 ± 19 (1 σ)

115 (21). This value is consistent with the Earth inorganic standard (Vienna Peedee Belemnite [VPDB]) which has ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C = 89$ (29). It is also consistent with measured values for Iapetus 116 ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C = 83 \pm 8$ (28) and with the range of ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C$ ratios, between 83 and 85, measured from 117 118 carbonate minerals in Ivuna-type carbonaceous chondrite meteorites and samples of the asteroid 119 Ryugu (30). These values could reflect primordial (present in the protosolar nebular) CO_2 which 120 could have been incorporated into Europa, if it assembled from materials that formed at 121 temperatures below $\sim 80 \text{ K}$ (31). Alternatively, the carbon in Europa's CO₂ could have been 122 inherited from accreted primitive organic matter in the Solar System, which has ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C = 90 \pm 1$ (32). The ratio of ${}^{13}C$ to ${}^{12}C$ is used as a biosignature on Earth (33), where localized carbon 123 124 sources and reservoirs can have higher ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C$ ratios (up to 104) due to biogenic processes (29). 125 For C isotopes to serve as a biosignature on Europa, the isotopic fractionation between reduced 126 carbon and CO_2 would need to be determined (34), which we cannot measure using these data 127 and therefore we cannot distinguish between abiotic or biogenic sources.

128 Nature and distribution of the CO₂ ice

129 The observed 4.25 μ m absorption band due to ¹²CO₂ has a double-peaked structure, which 130 differs from the single-peaked crystalline CO₂ ice (see Fig. 1C). The synthetic spectrum of 131 crystalline CO₂ ice in Fig. 1C was computed with the surface model of the Planetary Spectrum 132 Generator (PSG) (21, 35). The best match we found to this doubly peaked shape (Fig. 1C) was to 133 a laboratory spectrum of a mixture of CO₂, H₂O, and CH₃OH in the ratio 1:0.8:0.9 respectively, 134 measured at a temperature of 114 K (36). The temperature of this laboratory spectrum is within 135 the range previously measured for different hemispheres of Europa (90 to 130 K) (37). This 136 could indicate that CO₂ is stored in a water and organic-rich matrix on Europa, yet we did not 137 detect any bands in our spectra due to CH₃OH ice or other organic molecules. We regard

138 methanol as a proxy for the effect of any organics on the band position of CO₂, and several other 139 effects could also produce shifts in the CO₂ fundamental band (21, 38). A blue-shifted CO₂ peak 140 has previously been observed on Ganymede and Callisto (39, 40), but did not show the same 141 double peak signature as we observe on Europa, perhaps due to differing spectral resolutions. 142 The closest match to the CO_2 band detected on Callisto and Ganymede was a laboratory 143 spectrum of carbonic acid (H_2CO_3), synthesized in a CO_2 : H_2O ice mixture (in the ratio 5:1), then 144 exposed to ionizing radiation in the form of 5 keV electrons (41). Similar laboratory irradiation 145 experiments have been reported for Europa-like conditions (42). Fig. 1C shows a synthetic 146 spectrum based on the carbonic acid experiment (41), which reproduces the width and location 147 of the band, but not its double peak. To further test a possible matrix for the observed CO₂, we 148 measured spectra of oceanic salt evaporite with a thin CO₂ ice film deposited onto the salts at 149 different temperatures while being irradiated (21). In the experiments, the feature at 4.25 μ m 150 appeared after irradiation of the salts, while the feature at 4.27 µm was present in freshly 151 deposited CO_2 . We therefore interpret the 4.25 μ m band as likely indicating CO_2 either adsorbed 152 onto salts or captured within them.

153 We searched for heterogeneities in the CO₂ ice abundance and its structure, by mapping the 154 strengths of the three ${}^{12}CO_2$ peaks across the observed hemisphere of Europa (Fig. 2); the ${}^{13}CO_2$ 155 feature is too weak for mapping. For the mapping process and at each spatial point, we fitted a 156 model of CO_2 crystalline ice model for the 2.7 µm feature, whereas we modeled the 4.25/4.27 157 µm double-peaked feature as a combination of two components: CO₂ crystalline ice (using the 158 model described above) and a CO_2 excess. The CO_2 excess model was constructed by 159 subtracting the synthetic spectra of the mixture of CO₂, H₂O and organic molecules, from the 160 crystalline CO₂ spectrum (Fig. 1C). All three bands are strongest in the chaos terrain Tara Regio, 161 and the 2.7 and 4.27 μ m CO₂ bands have similar distributions (Fig. 2). The 4.25 μ m band has a 162 larger dynamic range, with almost no detection in the northern regions, and a lower abundance 163 between Tara Regio and the anti-Jovian regions (Fig. 2D). The most abundant surface CO₂ 164 appears to be in Tara Regio, potentially indicating this geologically distinct region is associated 165 with an endogenous source of CO_2 . The distribution of the 4.25 μ m CO₂ band is similar to 166 previous observations of irradiated NaCl on Europa (11), whereas the 2.7 µm and 4.27 µm are 167 distributed more broadly across Europa's surface. This is consistent with our interpretation (see 168 above) that the 4.25 μ m feature is due to CO₂ mixed with salts or produced via irradiation of 169 carbonate salts.

170 An endogenous source of CO₂

171 CO₂ has been observed on a wide variety of Solar System objects and can have either native 172 (endogenous) or non-native (exogenous) origins. The localized CO₂ we observe on Europa could 173 be related to a disrupted surface, with a difference in the surface grain sizes affecting the strength 174 of the CO_2 absorption across the surface (43). Exogenous explanations for the observed CO_2 on 175 Europa are possible, but an exogenous source would likely produce a more global distribution, 176 not the observed local concentration that is associated with salts (which are presumably 177 endogenous). CO_2 ice is also localized on Enceladus, where it is known to be endogenous (44). 178 Exogenous interplanetary dust grains might deliver carbonaceous material to Europa's icy 179 surface, which could then yield CO₂ through radiolysis (42), but no silicate features indicative of 180 such exogenous material have been reported for Europa (25). Given the CO_2 association with 181 NaCl, and our laboratory results (21), we conclude that the most likely origin of the observed 182 CO₂ is endogenous, at least within Tara Regio.

183 We consider several possible endogenous sources of CO_2 . One possibility is that aqueous 184 solutions rich in CO_2 are present in the subsurface. Such solutions could be present if a long-185 lived reservoir, such as Europa's ocean, has a low enough pH (26), or if fluids migrating through 186 Europa's ice shell incorporate CO₂ derived from destabilized dry ice or CO₂ clathrate hydrate 187 (45). A second potential source of CO_2 could be carbonate-bearing fluids (e.g., NaHCO₃ or 188 Na₂CO₃ dissolved in water). Enceladus has a carbonate-rich ocean that degases CO₂ (46); some 189 of that degassed CO_2 freezes out on the surface (47). An analogous process could occur on 190 Europa. Alternatively, endogenous carbonates could react with acid compounds (e.g., H_2SO_4) at 191 or near the surface to produce CO₂, or extruded brines (if they contain (bi)carbonate salts) could 192 produce CO_2 during radiation processing (48). A third possibility is that the carbon in the CO_2 193 might have been from organic compounds that were originally dissolved or suspended in a 194 subsurface liquid water reservoir, which were later converted to CO_2 . CO_2 might be generated by 195 irradiation on the surface, when material sourced from Europa's interior, rich in carbonate salts 196 and/or organics mixed with H₂O, is bombarded by charged particles trapped in Jupiter's 197 magnetosphere (49). A similar process has been proposed to form hydrogen peroxide (H_2O_2) 198 from H₂O ice; H₂O₂ has previously been observed to be enriched at low latitudes across Europa's 199 leading and anti-Jovian quadrants, including within the boundaries of Tara Regio (50). Because 200 the surface environment of Europa is strongly oxidized, CO₂ would be produced by radiation-201 driven oxidation of reduced carbon species (organics) on Europa's surface; the lack of detectable 202 CO could be an indication of that process (49). Regardless of the specific source species of CO₂, 203 we regard the presence of CO₂ in a region with previous indications of subsurface liquid water as 204 evidence of carbon availability in Europa's interior.





207 Figure 1: Spectra of Europa's leading hemisphere acquired with JWST. A) Spectrum from

208 2.5 to 5.2 µm (blue) expressed as spectral irradiance in units of jansky (Jy). Grey shaded regions 209 indicate the ranges plotted in the other panels. Broad features due to H₂O and CO₂ ices are

210 labelled. Narrower features are mostly Fraunhofer lines from sunlight reflected off Europa. B)

211 Zoomed spectrum (black histogram) around the band of crystalline CO_2 ice at 2.7 μ m,

212 normalized by the local continuum. The green line shows a solar spectrum, used to identify the

213 Fraunhofer lines. The dark purple line is a model of crystalline CO₂ ice; the light purple shading

indicates the integrated band strength used to produce the map in Fig. 2B. C) Same as panel B, 214

215 but for the double-peaked CO_2 feature at 4.27 µm. The blue line is a model of a

216 CO₂:H₂O:CH₃OH [1:0.8:0.9] mixture at 114 K. The shape of the observed spectrum is fitted with

a combination of the blue and purple models. The peak position and width of the feature can 217

218 alternatively be reproduced by a model (dashed red line) of carbonic acid synthesized in a

219 CO₂:H₂O ice mixture (ratio 5:1) exposed to ionizing radiation.

220



221

Figure 2: Distribution of CO₂ on Europa. A) A false-color image of Europa as it appeared
 during the JWST observations (21). The image is over-sampled at 0.031" per pixel; the
 diffraction-limited resolution is ~0.08" at these wavelengths. B) Distribution of the band

intensity of the CO₂ 2.7 μ m feature, determined by fitting a model of CO₂ crystalline ice to the

spectrum at each location. The white circle indicates the size of Europa in panel A. C-D) The

 $4.25/4.27 \mu m$ double-peaked feature was modeled as a combination of two components: CO₂

crystalline ice (band intensity shown in panel C) and CO₂ non-crystalline ice (band intensity

shown panel D). Panels B, C and D share the same color-bar, but with different

230 maximum/middle values of 0.70/0.35, 4.20/2.10 and 7.10/3.55 nm respectively.

231

232

233 References

- 1. S. M. Howell, The Likely Thickness of Europa's Icy Shell. *Planet. Sci. J.* 2, 129 (2021).
- M. G. Kivelson, K. K. Khurana, C. T. Russell, M. Volwerk, R. J. Walker, C. Zimmer,
 Galileo Magnetometer Measurements: A Stronger Case for a Subsurface Ocean at Europa.
 Science. 289, 1340–1343 (2000).
- N. Schilling, F. M. Neubauer, J. Saur, Time-varying interaction of Europa with the jovian magnetosphere: Constraints on the conductivity of Europa's subsurface ocean. *Icarus*. 192, 41–55 (2007).
- 4. B. E. Schmidt, D. D. Blankenship, G. W. Patterson, P. M. Schenk, Active formation of
 'chaos terrain' over shallow subsurface water on Europa. *Nature*. 479, 502–505 (2011).
- P. M. Schenk, C. R. Chapman, K. Zahnle, J. M. Moore, *Ages and interiors: the cratering record of the Galilean satellites.* Jupiter: The planet, satellites and magnetosphere. Edited
 by Fran Bagenal, Timothy E. Dowling, William B. McKinnon. Cambridge planetary
 science, Vol. 1, Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, ISBN 0-521-81808-7, p. 427
 456 (2004).
- S. A. Fagents, Considerations for effusive cryovolcanism on Europa: The post-Galileo
 perspective. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets.* 108 (2003),
 doi:10.1029/2003JE002128.
- R. T. Pappalardo, et al., Geological evidence for solid-state convection in Europa's ice
 shell. *Nature*. 391, 365–368 (1998).
- K. P. Hand, C. F. Chyba, J. C. Priscu, R. W. Carlson, K. H. Nealson, *Astrobiology and the Potential for Life on Europa*. Europa: Edited by Robert T. Pappalardo et al. University of Arizona Press, Tucson. ISBN: 9780816528448 (2009)
- 256 9. G. P. Kuiper, Infrared observations of planets and satellites. *The Astronomical Journal.* 62, 245–245 (1957).
- M. E. Brown, K. P. Hand, Salts and Radiation Products on the Surface of Europa. *The Astronomical Journal.* 145, 110 (2013).
- S. K. Trumbo, M. E. Brown, K. P. Hand, Sodium chloride on the surface of Europa.
 Science Advances. 5, eaaw7123 (2019).
- 12. G. B. Hansen, T. B. McCord, Widespread CO2 and other non-ice compounds on the anti Jovian and trailing sides of Europa from Galileo/NIMS observations. *Geophysical Research Letters.* 35 (2008), doi:10.1029/2007GL031748.

265 266 267	13.	N. Ligier, F. Poulet, J. Carter, R. Brunetto, F. Gourgeot, VLT/SINFONI Observations of Europa: New Insights into the Surface Composition. <i>The Astronomical Journal.</i> 151 , 163 (2016).
268 269 270	14.	T. B. McCord, et al., Non-water-ice constituents in the surface material of the icy Galilean satellites from the Galileo near-infrared mapping spectrometer investigation. <i>Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets.</i> 103 , 8603–8626 (1998).
271 272	15.	L. Roth, J. Saur, K. D. Retherford, D. F. Strobel, P. D. Feldman, M. A. McGrath, F. Nimmo, Transient Water Vapor at Europa's South Pole. <i>Science</i> . 343 , 171–174 (2014).
273 274	16.	X. Jia, M. G. Kivelson, K. K. Khurana, W. S. Kurth, Evidence of a plume on Europa from Galileo magnetic and plasma wave signatures. <i>Nature Astronomy</i> 2 , 459–464 (2018).
275 276 277	17.	W. B. Sparks, K. P. Hand, M. A. McGrath, E. Bergeron, M. Cracraft, S. E. Deustua, Probing for Evidence of Plumes on Europa with HST/STIS. <i>Astrophysical Journal</i> . 829 , 121 (2016).
278 279	18.	G. Giono, et al. An Analysis of the Statistics and Systematics of Limb Anomaly Detections in HST/STIS Transit Images of Europa. <i>The Astronomical Journal.</i> 159 , 155 (2020).
280 281	19.	L. Paganini, et al., A measurement of water vapour amid a largely quiescent environment on Europa. <i>Nature Astronomy</i> . 4 , 266–272 (2020).
282 283	20.	J. P. Gardner, et al., The James Webb Space Telescope Mission. <i>Publications of the Astronomical Society of the Pacific.</i> 135 , 068001 (2023).
284	21.	Materials and Methods are available as supplementary materials.
285 286	22.	G. L. Villanueva, et al., JWST molecular mapping and characterization of Enceladus' water plume feeding its torus. <i>Nature Astronomy</i> . 10 (2023).
287 288 289	23.	R. W. Carlson, P. R. Weissman, W. D. Smythe, J. C. Mahoney, The NIMS Science and Engineering Teams, Near-Infrared Mapping Spectrometer experiment on Galileo. <i>Space Sci Rev.</i> 60 , 457–502 (1992).
290 291	24.	R. W. Carlson, et al., Hydrogen Peroxide on the Surface of Europa. <i>Science</i> . 283 , 2062–2064 (1999).
292 293	25.	R. W. Carlson, et al., Europa's Surface Composition. Europa: Edited by Robert T. Pappalardo et al. University of Arizona Press, Tucson. ISBN: 9780816528448 (2009).
294 295	26.	M. Melwani Daswani, S. D. Vance, M. J. Mayne, C. R. Glein, A Metamorphic Origin for Europa's Ocean. <i>Geophysical Research Letters</i> . 48-18, doi:10.1029/2021GL094143 (2021).
296		

- 297 27. I. Mishra, et al., A Comprehensive Revisit of Select Galileo/NIMS Observations of Europa.
 298 *Planet. Sci. J.* 2, 183 (2021).
- 28. R. N. Clark, R. H. Brown, D. P. Cruikshank, G. A. Swayze, Isotopic ratios of Saturn's rings and satellites: Implications for the origin of water and Phoebe. *Icarus*. **321**, 791–802
 (2019).
- T. B. Coplen, et al., Compilation of minimum and maximum isotope ratios of selected
 elements in naturally occurring terrestrial materials and reagents, *Water-Resources Investigations Report*. U.S. Geological Survey Numbered Series 2001–4222,
 doi:10.3133/wri014222 (2001).
- 30. K. A. McCain, et al., Early fluid activity on Ryugu inferred by isotopic analyses of
 307 carbonates and magnetite. *Nature Astronomy*. 7, 309–317 (2023).
- 308 31. O. Mousis, J. I. Lunine, A. Aguichine, The Nature and Composition of Jupiter's Building
 309 Blocks Derived from the Water Abundance Measurements by the Juno Spacecraft.
 310 Astrophysical Journal Letters. 918, L23 (2021).
- 311 32. C. M. O. Alexander, M. Fogel, H. Yabuta, G. D. Cody, The origin and evolution of
 chondrites recorded in the elemental and isotopic compositions of their macromolecular
 organic matter. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta*. 71, 4380–4403 (2007).
- 314 33. J. M. Hayes, K. H. Freeman, B. N. Popp, C. H. Hoham, Compound-specific isotopic
 analyses: A novel tool for reconstruction of ancient biogeochemical processes. *Organic* 316 *Geochemistry*. 16, 1115–1128 (1990).
- 317 34. M. van Zuilen, Stable Isotope Ratios as a Biomarker on Mars. *Space Sci Rev.* 135, 221–232
 318 (2008).
- 319 35. G. L. Villanueva, et al., Fundamentals of the Planetary Spectrum Generator: 2022 Edition.
 320 ISBN 978-0-578-36143-7 (2022).
- 36. P. Ehrenfreund, O. Kerkhof, W. A. Schutte, A. C. A. Boogert, P. A. Gerakines, E. Dartois,
 Laboratory studies of thermally processed H₂O-CH₃OH-CO₂ ice mixtures and their
 astrophysical implications. *Astron. Astrophys.* 350, 240-253 (1999).
- 37. J. A. Rathbun, N. J. Rodriguez, J. R. Spencer, Galileo PPR observations of Europa: Hotspot
 detection limits and surface thermal properties. *Icarus*. 210, 763–769 (2010).
- 326 38. D. P. Cruikshank, et al., Carbon dioxide on the satellites of Saturn: Results from the Cassini
 327 VIMS investigation and revisions to the VIMS wavelength scale. *Icarus*. 206, 561–572
 328 (2010).
- 329 39. C. A. Hibbitts, T. B. McCord, G. B. Hansen, Distributions of CO₂ and SO₂ on the surface of
 330 Callisto. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets.* 105, 22541–22557 (2000).

- 40. T. B. McCord, et al., Organics and Other Molecules in the Surfaces of Callisto and
 Ganymede. *Science*. 278, 271–275 (1997).
- 41. B. M. Jones, R. I. Kaiser, G. Strazzulla, Carbonic Acid as a Reserve of Carbon Dioxide on
 Icy Moons: The Formation of Carbon Dioxide (CO₂) in a Polar Environment. *Astrophysical Journal* 788, 170 (2014).
- 42. K. P. Hand, R. W. Carlson, C. F. Chyba, Energy, Chemical Disequilibrium, and Geological
 Constraints on Europa. *Astrobiology*. 7, 1006–1022 (2007).
- R. N. Clark, et al., Compositional mapping of Saturn's satellite Dione with Cassini VIMS
 and implications of dark material in the Saturn system. *Icarus*. 193, 372–386 (2008).
- 340 44. J.-P. Combe, T. B. McCord, D. L. Matson, T. V. Johnson, A. G. Davies, F. Scipioni, F.
 341 Tosi, Nature, distribution and origin of CO₂ on Enceladus. *Icarus*. **317**, 491–508 (2019).
- 342 45. N. C. Shibley, G. Laughlin, Do Oceanic Convection and Clathrate Dissociation Drive
 343 Europa's Geysers? *Planet. Sci. J.* 2, 221 (2021).
- 46. C. R. Glein, J. H. Waite, The Carbonate Geochemistry of Enceladus' Ocean. *Geophysical Research Letters*, 47-3, doi:10.1029/2019GL085885 (2020).
- 346 47. R. H. Brown, et al., Composition and Physical Properties of Enceladus' Surface. *Science*.
 347 311, 1425–1428 (2006).
- 348 48. J. F. Cooper, R. E. Johnson, B. H. Mauk, H. B. Garrett, N. Gehrels, Energetic Ion and
 349 Electron Irradiation of the Icy Galilean Satellites. *Icarus.* 149, 133–159 (2001).
- 49. K. P. Hand, R. W. Carlson, Laboratory spectroscopic analyses of electron irradiated alkanes
 and alkenes in solar system ices. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets.* 117 (2012),
 doi:10.1029/2011JE003888.
- S. K. Trumbo, M. E. Brown, K. P. Hand, H₂O₂ within Chaos Terrain on Europa's Leading
 Hemisphere. *The Astronomical Journal*. 158, 127 (2019).
- 51. T. Böker, et al., The Near-Infrared Spectrograph (NIRSpec) on the James Webb Space
 Telescope III. Integral-field spectroscopy. *Astronomy & Astrophysics*. 661, A82 (2022).
- 357 52. M. J. Rieke, et al. Performance of NIRCam on JWST in Flight. *Publications of the*358 *Astronomical Society of the Pacific.* 135, 028001 (2023).
- 359 53. H. Bushouse, et al., JWST Calibration Pipeline, doi:10.5281/zenodo.7229890 (2022).
- J. Madden, L. Kaltenegger, A Catalog of Spectra, Albedos, and Colors of Solar System
 Bodies for Exoplanet Comparison. *Astrobiology*. 18, 1559–1573 (2018).

362 55. G. L. Villanueva, M. D. Smith, S. Protopapa, S. Faggi, A. M. Mandell, Planetary Spectrum
 363 Generator: An accurate online radiative transfer suite for atmospheres, comets, small bodies

- and exoplanets. *Journal of Quantitative Spectroscopy and Radiative Transfer.* 217, 86–104
 (2018).
- 56. S. Protopapa, et al., Pluto's global surface composition through pixel-by-pixel Hapke
 modeling of New Horizons Ralph/LEISA data. *Icarus*. 287, 218–228 (2017).
- 57. E. Quirico, B. Schmitt, A Spectroscopic Study of CO Diluted in N₂ Ice: Applications for
 Triton and Pluto. *Icarus.* 128, 181–188 (1997).
- 58. G. L. Villanueva, M. J. Mumma, B. P. Bonev, R. E. Novak, R. J. Barber, M. A. Disanti,
 Water in planetary and cometary atmospheres: H₂O/HDO transmittance and fluorescence
 models. *Journal of Quantitative Spectroscopy and Radiative Transfer.* 113, 202–220
 (2012).
- 59. G. L. Villanueva, M. A. Disanti, M. J. Mumma, L.-H. Xu, A Quantum Band Model of the
 v₃ Fundamental of Methanol (CH₃OH) and its Application to Fluorescence Spectra of
 Comets. *The Astrophysical Journal.* 747, 1–11 (2012).
- G. L. Villanueva, M. J. Mumma, K. Magee-Sauer, Ethane in planetary and cometary
 atmospheres: Transmittance and fluorescence models of the v₇ band at 3.3 μm. *Journal of Geophysical Research.* 116, 1–23 (2011).
- 380 61. C. D. Rodgers, *Inverse Methods for Atmospheric Sounding: Theory and Practice*. World
 381 Scientific, ISBN: 978-981-281-371-8 (2000).
- 382 62. R. N. Clark, et al., The surface composition of Iapetus: Mapping results from Cassini
 383 VIMS. *Icarus.* 218, 831–860 (2012).
- W. M. Grundy, L. A. Young, J. R. Spencer, R. E. Johnson, E. F. Young, M. W. Buie,
 Distributions of H₂O and CO₂ ices on Ariel, Umbriel, Titania, and Oberon from IRTF/SpeX
 observations. *Icarus.* 184, 543–555 (2006).
- R. J. Cartwright, J. P. Emery, A. S. Rivkin, D. E. Trilling, N. Pinilla-Alonso, Distribution of
 CO₂ ice on the large moons of Uranus and evidence for compositional stratification of their
 near-surfaces. *Icarus.* 257, 428–456 (2015).
- K. P. Hand, R. W. Carlson, Europa's surface color suggests an ocean rich with sodium chloride. *Geophysical Research Letters*. 42, 3174–3178 (2015).
- 66. C. J. Bennett, C. Pirim, T. M. Orlando, Space-Weathering of Solar System Bodies: A
 Laboratory Perspective. *Chem. Rev.* 113, 9086–9150 (2013).
- G. Strazzulla, Cosmic ion bombardment of the icy moons of Jupiter. *Nuclear Instruments and Methods in Physics Research Section B: Beam Interactions with Materials and Atoms*.
 269, 842–851 (2011).
- K. P. Hand, R. W. Carlson, H2O2 production by high-energy electrons on icy satellites as a function of surface temperature and electron flux. *Icarus.* 215, 226–233 (2011).

- Berisford, et al., Erosion of Penitentes Under Experimental Conditions Relevant to
 Ice-Covered Airless Worlds. *Journal of Geophysical Research: Planets. Vol* 126-10.
 doi:10.1029/2021JE006955 (2021).
- 402 70. M. H. Moore, R. K. Khanna, Infrared and mass spectral studies of proton irradiated H₂O +
 403 CO₂ ice: Evidence for carbonic acid. *Spectrochimica Acta Part A: Molecular Spectroscopy*.
- **4**04 **47**, 255–262 (1991).

405

406 Acknowledgements: This work is based on observations made with the NASA/ESA/CSA James 407 Webb Space Telescope. The data under program ID 1250 were obtained from the Mikulski 408 Archive for Space Telescopes (MAST) at the Space Telescope Science Institute, which is 409 operated by the Association of Universities for Research in Astronomy, Inc., under NASA 410 contract NAS 5-03127 for JWST. We thank Bob Carlson (1941-2022) for assisting in setting the 411 guiding principles of the Europa observational program, and in supporting the experimental 412 framework at JPL that we employed in this work. 413 Funding: GLV, SF and VK were supported by NASA's Goddard Astrobiology Program, 414 Goddard's Fundamental Laboratory Research (FLaRe), and Sellers Exoplanet Environments 415 Collaboration (SEEC). SNM and HBH acknowledge support from NASA JWST 416 Interdisciplinary Scientist grant 21-SMDSS21-0013. CRG was supported by NASA through 417 Europa Lander funding (award #80NSSC19K0611). KPH acknowledges support from the NASA 418 Astrobiology Program (award #80NSSC19K1427) and the Europa Lander Pre-Project, managed 419 by the Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, under a contract with 420 NASA. 421 Author contributions: GLV, HBH, SNM, KPH, LP, J Stansberry, J Spencer, and GS designed

Author contributions: GLV, HBH, SNM, KPH, LP, J Stansberry, J Spencer, and GS designed
and planned the observations. GLV, SF, VK, RC, J Stansberry, SP and GL analyzed the data,
extracted calibrated spectra, produced the maps and performed retrievals. CRG, LR and GCM
assisted with discussion and interpretation of the results. All authors contributed to the
preparation, writing and editing of the manuscript.

426 **Competing interests:** There are no competing interests to declare.

- 427 **Data and materials availability:** The JWST data are available from MAST at
- 428 https://mast.stsci.edu/ under proposal ID 1250. Our laboratory spectra are provided in Data S1.
- 429 The data reduction scripts that we developed are available in Data S2.

430

431 Supplementary Materials:

- 432 Materials and Methods
- 433 Figures S1 and S2
- 434 Data S1 and S2
- 435 References (*50-69*)

Supplementary Materials for

Endogenous CO₂ ice on the surface of Europa and no detection of plume activity

G. L. Villanueva, H. B. Hammel, S. N. Milam, S. Faggi, V. Kofman, L. Roth, K. P. Hand, L. Paganini, J. Stansberry, J. Spencer, S. Protopapa, G. Strazzulla, G. Cruz-Mermy, C. R. Glein, R. Cartwright, G. Liuzzi

Corresponding author: <u>geronimo.villanueva@nasa.gov</u>

This PDF file includes:

Materials and Methods Figs. S1 to S2 Captions for Data S1 to S2

Other supporting files for this paper:

Data S1 (.txt file) Data S2 (.py file)

Materials and Methods

Data acquisition and analysis

NIRSpec observations were made in integral field unit (IFU) mode (51), using three highresolution gratings (G140H, G235H, G395H) and two detectors per grating (nrs1, nrs2) The resulting data cube has a spatial resolution of $0.1"\times0.1"$ and a $3"\times3"$ field of view (FOV). To minimize saturation, we employed the rapid readout and the shortest integration time available for the IFU mode (4×10.74 s), yet most of the G140H/nrs1-nrs2 and G235H/nrs1 exposures were saturated. Fig. 1 shows flux-calibrated spectra for the integrated signal across the Europa disk (~1" diameter). NIRCam (52) observations were made using the sub-array readout (64×72 pixels), with rapid readout and short integration time (50×0.05 s) to minimize saturation.

The data were processed employing the JWST Science Calibration Pipeline (53) v1.8.2, and the calibrated frames were analyzed and corrected for dithering and cleaned of bad-pixels using standard data processing methods with scripts available in Data S2. We also validated and benchmarked the flux calibration by comparing to previously reported flux-calibrated low-resolution Europa spectra (54). The imaging of Europa was performed by employing two NIRCam filters, F140M [1.331-1.479 μ m] and F212N [2.109-2.134 μ m]. The two images were combined to compute a false color image of Europa as shown in Fig. 2A, where the green component is F212N, the blue component is 0.7×F140M, and the red component is (F212N - 0.7×F140M)×4.

Spectroscopic interpretation, surface scattering modeling and plume radiative transfer modeling were performed using PSG (*35*, *55*, *56*). Surface reflectances as shown in Fig. 1B-C were modelled using the surface module of PSG that integrates laboratory/model absorbances with optical constants. The reflectance spectrum of crystalline CO₂ as shown in Fig. 1B and Fig. 1C was computed using the optical constants from the SSHADE/GhoSST database (*57*), with the imaginary part of the refractive index includes values derived from a thick crystal at 179 K and from thin films at 28 K. The model of CO₂ water/organic mixture shown Fig. 1C was synthesized using the absorbance laboratory spectrum as reported in (*36*) for a mixture of CO₂, H₂O, and CH₃OH in the ratio 1:0.8:0.9 respectively, measured at a temperature of 114 K. The synthetic reflectance spectrum of carbonic acid (H₂CO₃), synthesized in a CO₂:H₂O ice mixture (in the ratio 5:1), then exposed to ionizing radiation in the form of 5 keV electrons (*41*).

These synthetic reflectance spectra were then used to assist with the mapping of the double-peak signal of CO_2 across the moon's surface. Specifically, we defined the CO_2 band in Europa as being composed of two components, a pure crystalline signature (modelled with the SSHADE/GhoSST constants and shown with a 'purple' shading in Fig. 1C) and a residual CO_2 signature, computed as the difference of the CO_2 water/organic model and the pure crystalline model (shown in 'cyan' in Fig. 1C). This is consistent with what is shown in Fig. 1C, in which the 'purple' crystalline signature is largely contained within the CO_2 water/organic signature, with a residual signature shown with a 'cyan' shade. At each spatial location on Europa's surface, we fitted the CO_2 signature as a mixture of these two components and retrieved the band

intensity for each component. These integrated band intensities for each component are shown in Fig. 2C-D.

Upper limits on plume or atmospheric molecular species

To search for narrow molecular features, we analyzed the residual spectra over the spectral regions shown in Fig. S1, after subtracting the observed Europa spectra from a continuum model which included solar Fraunhofer lines. The Europa spectral extract was performed over a 1.3" diameter circular aperture over the IFU calibrated frame. The residuals were then compared to synthetic fluorescence emission spectra, by employing a retrieval algorithm. The fluorescence models in PSG account for non-LTE (Local-Thermodynamic-Equilibrium) radiative-transfer effects and incorporate billions of transitions/cascade processes (58-60), while the retrieval algorithm in PSG is based on the optimal estimation method (61). After each iteration of the retrieval algorithm, a model was constructed, and numerical derivatives were computed for each parameter. This process was repeated until convergence was achieved, and the differences between data and model were minimized. The mean statistical variation of the residual spectra (root-mean-square) was used to quantify the uncertainty (sigma) in the retrieved column densities. As shown in Fig. S1, the residuals are dominated by broad unaccounted features, which probably originate from calibration/instrument issues (e.g., detector readout patterns, fringing) and perhaps weak unidentified ice features.

Laboratory experiments on CO2 in salt mixtures

Europa's surface is dominated by water ice (9), a complex mixture of other compounds (14), including salts (e.g., NaCl, hydrated sulfates) (10, 11), hydrogen peroxide (24, 50) and carbon- (e.g., CO₂) and sulfur-bearing molecular species (12–14). Interestingly, CO₂ has been detected beyond Europa on many other Solar System objects, where it has been shown to have both native (endogenous) and non-native (exogenous) origins (43, 62–64). In the case of Europa, the geographic association of irradiated NaCl (11, 65) with the detected CO₂ features as we observe with JWST, could imply an endogenous source from a salty subsurface ocean. The observation of CO₂, but lack of CO, in our JWST spectra could indicate that CO₂ is radiolytically derived from ocean salts or organics, once emplaced on Europa's irradiated surface. Previous laboratory experiments examined energetic particles irradiating frozen gases. They found that in the presence of water ice, radiolysis produces CO₂ that can be derived from numerous species as a carbon source, ranging from volatile species (e.g. CO and CH₄), to less volatile (e.g. C₆H₆, CH₃OH), to refractory materials, such as asphaltite and amorphous carbon (66, 67).

In order to test the possible state of the observed CO_2 ice, we performed experiments in the Ocean Worlds Lab at JPL (Jet Propulsion Laboratory) (68, 69), with data available in Data S1. Figure S2 shows a comparison between these laboratory experiments and our JWST data. Panels S2A and S2B show the variation of the CO_2 feature as a function of its association with salts, irradiation, and temperature. The salts used were the sea salt mixture ASTM (American Society of Testing and Materials) D 1141-98 Formula a, from Lake Products Company. An ocean mixture was prepared and subjected to a solar irradiance and sublimation stage, which generated a salt evaporite lag that was then directly transferred to the ultra-high vacuum irradiation chamber. The salts were initially irradiated at 10 keV and approximately 30 μ A without any CO₂

ice deposited on top and monitored employing an infrared spectrometer. During this time the feature at 4.25 μ m emerged, likely from radiolytically processed NaHCO₃, which comprised 0.477% by weight of the original salt mixture. We cannot rule out a small contribution from remnant CO₂ contaminant in the vacuum chamber, which was maintained at a pressure of <10⁻⁸ Torr. After irradiation of the ocean salt evaporite, a CO₂ ice film was vapor deposited on the salt to examine the CO₂ band position.

The feature at 4.25 μ m appeared after irradiation of the salts, while the feature at 4.27 μ m is from the freshly deposited CO₂. The sample was then irradiated a second time under the same conditions, and the CO₂ features were monitored. The second spectrum (Fig. S2A) shows the resulting modulation of the bands in the 4.25 μ m and 4.27 μ m regions at 70 K, with the CO₂ ice feature at 4.27 μ m appearing stronger. Upon heating to 100 K and 130 K, the spectra show loss of the CO₂ ice but retention of the complexed CO₂ at 4.25 μ m, which is likely either adsorbed onto, or captured within, the salts. As the sample temperature increased, the 4.25 μ m band strength increased relative to the 4.27 μ m band. This higher temperature range is consistent with observations of low latitude daytime temperatures on Europa (*37*) and could be responsible for the structure of the CO₂ absorption feature observed with JWST (Fig. S2C).

Previous experiments showed that CO_2 and water ice mixtures yield a CO_2 band position of 4.269 μ m (70). In Fig. S2, we observe a slight redward shift of the CO_2 ice feature to 4.277 μ m when CO_2 is deposited onto salts and no associated water ice. On Europa, the JWST data at 4.269 μ m position could indicate that CO_2 is mixed with water ice.

Isotopic ¹²C/¹³C ratio of the observed CO₂

After removing the solar features visible in Fig. 1, we obtained the JWST spectrum shown in Fig. S2C. This includes an absorption feature at 4.386 μ m due to ¹³CO₂ (70). The intensity of CO₂ ices features in the 4.2 to 4.4 µm region depends on the host ice matrix and its temperature, however we derive a first approximation of the isotopic ratio from the integrated band intensities. We consider that the model shown in Fig. 1C for crystalline CO₂ is based on optical constants adopting for Earth's isotopic ratio, Vienna Peedee Belemnite [VPDB] with ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C=89.4 \pm 0.2$ (29). Using the model spectrum of crystalline CO₂, we derived a band intensity ratio between the 12 CO₂ feature at 4.210 to 4.300 µm and the 13 CO₂ feature at 4.369 to 4.392 µm, measuring a band ratio of 51 ± 10 . From the Europa spectrum shown in Fig. S2C, we performed the same integration and obtained a band ratio of 47 ± 9 . The ¹³CO₂ band is detected at a higher precision on Europa, corresponding to a band ratio of 47 ± 3 when only considering the observational NIRSpec noise of the data. However, the accuracy of this ratio is mostly limited by uncertainties in the baseline definition, and the possible variation of the band ratios for different CO₂ mixtures. By exploring multiple baseline corrections and integration ranges, we estimate that the accuracy of this ratio is $\pm 20\%$ at the 1-sigma level when operating with band integrations. This implies that the ${}^{12}C/{}^{13}C$ isotopic ratio of the CO₂ ice on Europa is 83 ± 19, corresponding to a nominal $\delta^{13}C([^{13}C/^{12}C]_{Europa}/[^{13}C/^{12}C]_{VPDB}-1) \text{ of } +80 \%.$



Figure S1: Residual spectra for three spectral regions used to search for CO, CH₃OH, C₂H₆, CH₄ and H₂O molecular emission. In comparison to the observed residual spectra, we show synthetic spectra of molecular fluorescence at different levels of plume abundance. Panel A shows the residuals for CO and the corresponding fluorescence model computed at the determined 3-sigma upper-limit $(1.4 \times 10^{31} \text{ molecules})$. This spectral region shows several unaccounted narrow features, not from CO, which are probably related to bad pixels, fringing and/or cosmic-ray hits. Panel B shows the hydrocarbons spectral region, which was used to search for CH₃OH, C₂H₆ and CH₄. The synthetic models were computed considering the corresponding 3-sigma upper-limits number of molecules for each species. Panel C shows the residuals for water, and in green the corresponding model computed at the 3-sigma level $(3.5 \times 10^{31} \text{ molecules})$. A model considering the enhanced H₂O levels $(7.0 \times 10^{31} \text{ molecules})$ as derived from a previous tentative observation (*19*) is shown in orange, and in blue we show a model considering the activity $(1.3 \times 10^{32} \text{ molecules})$ inferred from HST observations (*15*).



Figure S2: Laboratory spectra of CO₂ oceanic salt complexes and comparison to JWST data. Panel A shows laboratory spectra of oceanic salt evaporite with a CO₂ ice film deposited onto the salts at 10^{-8} Torr and at different temperatures and later being irradiated. For reference, we also show the pre-irradiation sample, which was done with a CO₂ film deposited at 70 K. Panel B shows the CO₂ features as measured from these experiments after subtracting a baseline from the spectra presented in panel A. These absorbance laboratory spectra were used to compute synthetic reflectance spectra with PSG as shown in panel C. Both temperature and irradiation, notably transform the shape of the CO₂ band in the collected laboratory spectra, and in particular the apparent ratio of the 4.25 and 4.27 µm features. Panel C shows these synthetic spectra in comparison to the residual Europa JWST spectrum, derived from Figure 1 after removing and normalizing by a solar continuum model. The double-peak shape of the CO₂ band is observed in both, in the laboratory and in JWST data of Europa, yet the peak at 4.27 µm is shifted relative to the JWST data, which could be related to water ice in the mixture on Europa's surface. A narrow feature observed at 4.386 µm is due to ${}^{13}CO_2$ ice.